

H9FKARNP

1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
2 SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

-----x

3 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

4 v.

17 CR 570 (ALC)

5 MICHAEL ARNSTEIN,

6 Defendant.

7 -----x

8 New York, N.Y.  
9 September 15, 2017  
11:35 p.m.

10 Before:

11 HON. ANDREW L. CARTER, JR.,

12 District Judge

13  
14 APPEARANCES

15 JOON H. KIM,  
16 Acting United States Attorney for the  
Southern District of New York  
17 SEBASTIAN SWETT  
Assistant United States Attorney

18 STEVEN L. BROUNSTEIN  
19 Attorney for Defendant

20 ALSO PRESENT:

21 RICHARD SMYTHE, FBI  
22 MAXIME VALEZ, U.S. MARSHALS SERVICE  
23  
24  
25

H9FKARNP

1           THE DEPUTY CLERK: Criminal cause for an arraignment  
2 and change-of-plea hearing in United States versus Michael  
3 Arnstein.

4           Counsel, please state your appearance.

5           For the government?

6           MR. SWETT: Good morning, your Honor. Sheb Swett, for  
7 the United States. I'm joined at counsel table by Special  
8 Agent Richard Smythe, of the FBI, and Deputy Marshal Maxime  
9 Valez, from the United States Marshals Service.

10          THE DEPUTY CLERK: And for the defendant?

11          MR. BROUNSTEIN: Steven Brounstein, for Mr. Arnstein.  
12 Good morning, sir.

13          THE COURT: Good morning.

14          Has Mr. Arnstein been presented on the complaint  
15 previously?

16          MR. SWETT: Mr. Arnstein was presented on the  
17 complaint. I believe it was in March, your Honor.

18          THE COURT: And has he been arraigned on the  
19 information, or has he waived indictment yet?

20          MR. SWETT: We have a signed waiver of indictment. He  
21 has not been arraigned on the information yet.

22          THE COURT: Okay. You say you have a signed waiver of  
23 indictment. You're talking about the form? Has he actually --

24          MR. SWETT: He has not waived in open court.

25          THE COURT: Okay.

H9FKARNP

1           Mr. Arnstein, I'm going to ask you some questions.  
2 I'm going to require that your answers be under oath, so I will  
3 ask my wonderful and talented deputy to administer the oath.

4           (Defendant sworn)

5           THE COURT: What is your full name?

6           THE DEFENDANT: Michael Andrew Arnstein.

7           THE COURT: How old are you?

8           THE DEFENDANT: Forty years old.

9           THE COURT: How far did you go in school?

10          THE DEFENDANT: Partial -- some college.

11          THE COURT: Are you currently, or have you recently  
12 been, under the care of a physician or a psychiatrist?

13          THE DEFENDANT: No.

14          THE COURT: In the last 24 hours, have you taken any  
15 drugs, medicine, or pills, or had any alcoholic beverages?

16          THE DEFENDANT: No, sir.

17          THE COURT: Have you been furnished with a copy of the  
18 charge against you? Have you seen a copy of the information?

19          THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I have.

20          THE COURT: The information has one count. It charges  
21 you with a conspiracy to forge a judge's signature. It reads  
22 as follows: "The United States Attorney charges:

23                "From at least in or about February 2014 up to and  
24 including in or about February 2017, in the Southern District  
25 of New York and elsewhere, Michael Arnstein, the defendant, and

H9FKARNP

1 others known and unknown, willfully and knowingly did combine,  
2 conspire, confederate, and agree together with each other to  
3 forge a judge's signature, in violation of Title 18, United  
4 States Code, Section 505.

5 "It was a part and an object of the conspiracy that  
6 Michael Arnstein, the defendant, and others known and unknown,  
7 willfully and knowingly would and did forge the signature of a  
8 judge, register, and other officer of any court of the United  
9 States, and forge and counterfeited the seal of any such court,  
10 and knowingly concurred in using any such forged or counterfeit  
11 signature and seal for the purpose of authenticating any  
12 proceeding and document, and tendered in evidence any such  
13 proceeding and document with a false counterfeit signature of  
14 any such judge, register, and other officer, and a false and  
15 counterfeit seal of the court subscribed and attached thereto,  
16 knowing such signature and seal to be false and counterfeit, in  
17 violation of Title 18, United States Code, Section 505."

18 Overt acts that are charged are:

19 "In furtherance of the conspiracy and to effect the  
20 illegal object thereof, the following overt acts were committed  
21 in the Southern District of New York and elsewhere:

22 "(a) On or about October 3rd, 2014, Michael Arnstein,  
23 the defendant, emailed an individual in the Southern District  
24 of New York and instructed that individual to create a  
25 counterfeit judicial order by digitally altering a genuine

H9FKARNP

1 judicial order;

2 "(b) On or about October 22nd, 2014, Michael  
3 Arnstein, the defendant, emailed a copy of a counterfeit  
4 judicial order to Google, Inc., and requested that Google  
5 de-index Uniform Resource Locators contained in the counterfeit  
6 order. Title 18, United States Code, Section 371."

7 Do you understand the nature of the charge contained  
8 in the information, Mr. Arnstein?

9 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, your Honor.

10 THE COURT: Have you discussed it with your attorney?

11 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, your Honor.

12 THE COURT: Counsel, do you feel that your client  
13 understands the charge against him?

14 MR. BROUNSTEIN: Yes, sir.

15 THE COURT: Mr. Arnstein, that charge contained in the  
16 information is a felony. As a result, you have a  
17 constitutional right to be charged by an indictment of the  
18 grand jury, but you can waive that right and consent to being  
19 charged by information of the U.S. Attorney.

20 Do you understand that?

21 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, sir.

22 THE COURT: Instead of an indictment, this felony  
23 charge against you has been brought by the U.S. Attorney by the  
24 filing of an information. Unless you waive indictment, you may  
25 not be charged with a felony unless a grand jury finds by

H9FKARNP

1 return of an indictment that there is probable cause to believe  
2 that a crime has been committed and that you committed it. If  
3 you do not waive indictment, the government may present the  
4 case to the grand jury and ask it to indict you.

5 Do you understand?

6 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, sir.

7 THE COURT: The grand jury is composed of at least 16  
8 and not more than 23 persons, and at least 12 grand jurors must  
9 find that there is probable cause to believe that you committed  
10 the crime with which you are charged before you may be  
11 indicted. The grand jury might or might not indict you. If  
12 you waive indictment by the grand jury, the case will proceed  
13 against you on the U.S. Attorney's information just as though  
14 you had been indicted.

15 Do you understand that?

16 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, sir.

17 THE COURT: Have you discussed waiving your right to  
18 indictment by the grand jury with your attorney?

19 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I have, sir.

20 THE COURT: Do you understand your right to indictment  
21 by a grand jury?

22 THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

23 THE COURT: Have any threats or promises been made to  
24 induce you to waive indictment?

25 THE DEFENDANT: No.

H9FKARNP

1 THE COURT: Do you wish to waive your right to  
2 indictment by a grand jury?

3 THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

4 THE COURT: Defense counsel, is there any reason why  
5 your client should not waive indictment?

6 MR. BROUNSTEIN: No, your Honor. I've discussed this  
7 thoroughly with him.

8 THE COURT: I believe there is a signed waiver of  
9 indictment that I have before me. Mr. Arnstein, is that your  
10 signature on that document?

11 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, it is.

12 THE COURT: Before signing it, did you read it?

13 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I have.

14 THE COURT: Did you discuss it with your attorney?

15 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, your Honor.

16 THE COURT: Did you sign that document because you  
17 wished to waive your right to indictment?

18 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I did.

19 THE COURT: I find that the waiver is knowingly and  
20 voluntarily made, and I accept it. We will proceed to  
21 arraignment on the information.

22 Mr. Arnstein, again, you've indicated that you  
23 understand the nature of the charge against you in the  
24 information, correct?

25 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I have.

H9FKARNP

1 THE COURT: The Court will enter a plea of not guilty  
2 on your behalf to the charge in the information.

3 Now, my understanding is that, Mr. Arnstein, you wish  
4 to withdraw that plea of not guilty and enter a plea of guilty  
5 to the sole count of the information pursuant to an agreement  
6 with the government. Is that correct?

7 THE DEFENDANT: That's accurate, your Honor.

8 THE COURT: Mr. Arnstein, you have a constitutional  
9 right to continue to plead not guilty. If you persist in that  
10 plea of not guilty, you have the right to a speedy and public  
11 trial by a jury. Do you understand?

12 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I do.

13 THE COURT: At that trial, and at every stage of this  
14 criminal litigation, you have the right to be represented by an  
15 attorney. Do you understand?

16 THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

17 THE COURT: If you cannot afford to hire your own  
18 attorney, the Court will give you an attorney for free. Do you  
19 understand?

20 THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

21 THE COURT: Counsel, are you retained or appointed on  
22 this matter?

23 MR. BROUNSTEIN: I'm retained, your Honor.

24 THE COURT: At trial, you would be presumed innocent.  
25 You would not have to prove that you're innocent. The burden



H9FKARNP

1 of proof would be on the government at all times, and they  
2 would have to prove each and every element of the crime charged  
3 beyond a reasonable doubt in order for you to be convicted of  
4 that crime.

5 Do you understand?

6 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I do.

7 THE COURT: So let's talk about those elements as it  
8 relates to the sole count of the information.

9 For the government to prove you guilty of the crime  
10 charged in Count One, conspiracy to forge a judge's signature,  
11 the government would have to prove the following beyond a  
12 reasonable doubt: That from about February 2014 up to and  
13 including February 2017, that you willfully and knowingly  
14 conspired with others to commit a crime.

15 Do you understand?

16 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, sir.

17 THE COURT: A conspiracy requires that you agree with  
18 at least one other person to commit a criminal act. Do you  
19 understand?

20 THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

21 THE COURT: The government would have to prove that  
22 you entered into that agreement knowingly and willfully. Do  
23 you understand?

24 THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

25 THE COURT: And knowingly and willfully understanding

H9FKARNP

1 the purpose of that agreement. Do you understand?

2 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, sir.

3 THE COURT: And the government would have to prove  
4 that the purpose or object of that agreement or conspiracy was  
5 to forge a judge's signature in violation of Title 18, United  
6 States Code, Section 505. Do you understand?

7 THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

8 THE COURT: And the government would be required to  
9 prove that you knowingly and willfully agreed with others that  
10 you would or someone in that conspiracy would forge the  
11 signature of a judge. Do you understand?

12 THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

13 THE COURT: And that that was a judge of the United  
14 States. Do you understand?

15 THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

16 THE COURT: And that you -- or that the people in the  
17 conspiracy forged the signature of that judge for the purpose  
18 of authenticating a document. Do you understand?

19 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, sir.

20 THE COURT: And that at the time that you or someone  
21 in the conspiracy forged the signature of a federal judge, of a  
22 United States judge, to authenticate a document, that you knew  
23 that the signature was false and counterfeit. Do you  
24 understand?

25 THE DEFENDANT: Correct. Yes.

H9FKARNP

1 THE COURT: In addition, if you plead guilty, you will  
2 be waiving your right to challenge the venue of the  
3 prosecution. Venue means that the government needs to bring  
4 the case in the judicial district where the crime took place.

5 Do you understand?

6 THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

7 THE COURT: Counsel for the government, have I left  
8 out any elements of the offense?

9 MR. SWETT: I would just add that as part of the  
10 conspiracy charge, the government would need to prove that a  
11 member of the conspiracy took an overt act in furtherance of  
12 the conspiracy.

13 THE COURT: Okay. Thank you.

14 In addition, Mr. Arnstein, the government would have  
15 to prove the commission of at least one overt act. Do you  
16 understand?

17 THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

18 THE COURT: The overt acts charged in the information  
19 are that: One, you emailed an individual in the Southern  
20 District of New York and instructed that individual to create a  
21 counterfeit judicial order by digitally altering a genuine  
22 judicial order. Do you understand?

23 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, sir.

24 THE COURT: The other overt act that the government  
25 would need to prove -- they'd have to prove one of these overt

H9FKARNP

1 acts. The other one that's alleged in the information is that  
2 on or about October 22nd, 2014, that you emailed a copy of a  
3 counterfeit judicial order to Google and requested that Google  
4 de-index Uniform Resource Locators contained in the counterfeit  
5 order.

6 Do you understand?

7 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, sir.

8 THE COURT: Thank you for that, counsel for the  
9 government. Are there any other elements that I have left out?

10 MR. SWETT: No, your Honor.

11 THE COURT: Okay.

12 Counsel for the defense, have I left out any elements?

13 MR. BROUNSTEIN: No, sir.

14 THE COURT: So, Mr. Arnstein, the government would  
15 have to prove each and every one of those elements beyond a  
16 reasonable doubt. Do you understand?

17 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, sir.

18 THE COURT: In order to attempt to prove those  
19 elements beyond a reasonable doubt, the government would call  
20 witnesses. Your lawyer could question witnesses. Do you  
21 understand?

22 THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

23 THE COURT: Your lawyer could object to evidence that  
24 the government sought to introduce against you. Do you  
25 understand?

H9FKARNP

1 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I do.

2 THE COURT: You could call your own witnesses at  
3 trial, and your lawyer would have the subpoena power of the  
4 United States to make witnesses come to court for you. Do you  
5 understand?

6 THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

7 THE COURT: In addition, you could testify on your own  
8 behalf at trial, but, at the same time, you could not be forced  
9 to testify because you have a right or privilege against  
10 self-incrimination. What the right or privilege against  
11 self-incrimination means is that you cannot be required to say  
12 anything out of your own mouth that makes you appear guilty.

13 Do you understand?

14 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I do.

15 THE COURT: So, even if you are guilty, you are not  
16 required to plead guilty. You could remain silent and force  
17 the government to attempt to prove each and every element of  
18 the crime charged beyond a reasonable doubt. Do you  
19 understand?

20 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I do.

21 THE COURT: If the government failed to prove any  
22 element of the crime charged beyond a reasonable doubt, the  
23 jury would be duty-bound to find you not guilty. Do you  
24 understand?

25 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I do.

H9FKARNP

1 THE COURT: So, again, even if you are guilty, you are  
2 not required to plead guilty. Do you understand?

3 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I do.

4 THE COURT: If you plead guilty, I will have to ask  
5 what you did that makes you guilty of the crime charged, and  
6 when you answer those questions, you'll be saying things out of  
7 your own mouth that make you appear guilty, thereby giving up  
8 your right or privilege against self-incrimination.

9 Do you understand?

10 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I do.

11 THE COURT: Let's talk about the sentencing process.

12 If I accept your plea of guilty, you'll meet with the  
13 probation department, and they will prepare a presentence or  
14 probation report. That report will have information about you  
15 and the crime that you are alleged to have committed.

16 Do you understand?

17 THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

18 THE COURT: That report will also have the probation  
19 department's sentencing guideline calculation. Have you and  
20 your attorney discussed the sentencing guidelines and how they  
21 might apply in your case?

22 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, we have.

23 THE COURT: The sentencing guidelines are advisory.  
24 What that means is, while I am required to determine the  
25 guideline range that applies to your case, once I make that

H9FKARNP

1 determination, I am not required to sentence you with that  
2 range. Do you understand?

3 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I do.

4 THE COURT: I will determine the guideline range, and  
5 I will determine the ultimate sentence in this case. So, as  
6 you sit here today, there is no promise as to what your  
7 guideline range will be, nor is there a promise as to what your  
8 sentence will be. Do you understand?

9 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, your Honor, I understand.

10 THE COURT: Let's talk about Court Exhibit 1, your  
11 agreement with the government. Your signature appears on the  
12 last page, I believe. Is that, in fact, your signature on the  
13 last page of that document?

14 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, it is, your Honor.

15 THE COURT: Before signing that document, did you read  
16 it?

17 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I have.

18 THE COURT: Do you understand it?

19 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I do.

20 THE COURT: Did you discuss it with your attorney?

21 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, we discussed it.

22 THE COURT: Does this document, Court Exhibit 1,  
23 contain the entirety of your agreement with the government?

24 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, it does.

25 THE COURT: Counsel for the government and the

H9FKARNP

1 defense, is that correct?

2 MR. SWETT: That is correct, your Honor.

3 MR. BROUNSTEIN: Yes, Judge, it encompasses what we  
4 agreed upon and also what we disagreed upon as well.

5 THE COURT: Okay.

6 Let's talk about the statutory penalties that apply.  
7 For Count One, there's a maximum sentence of five years'  
8 imprisonment. Do you understand?

9 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I do.

10 THE COURT: There's a maximum term of three years of  
11 supervised release. Do you understand?

12 THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

13 THE COURT: Supervised release is like a term of  
14 probation you would serve after a term of custody. You will be  
15 subject to drug testing, visits to a probation officer's  
16 office, and other limitations on your freedom. Do you  
17 understand?

18 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I do.

19 THE COURT: If you were to violate a condition of  
20 supervised release, you could be sentenced to an additional  
21 term of custody and an additional term of supervised release  
22 without credit for time previously served in custody or on  
23 supervised release. Do you understand?

24 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I understand.

25 THE COURT: You'd also be subject to the possibility



H9FKARNP

1 of a fine, which would be based on your ability to pay it. For  
2 Count One, the maximum fine is \$250,000. Do you understand?

3 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I understand.

4 THE COURT: In addition, you would be subject to a  
5 special assessment of \$100, which is like a fine, except it is  
6 mandatory, and I must impose the \$100 special assessment, and  
7 you must pay it. Do you understand?

8 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I do.

9 THE COURT: Have you seen the government's guideline  
10 estimate that's contained in your agreement?

11 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, your Honor.

12 THE COURT: I want to reiterate to you that that is  
13 simply an estimate. That is not binding on the probation  
14 department, it's not binding on me. Do you understand?

15 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, sir.

16 THE COURT: I will determine the guideline range, and  
17 I will determine the sentence. Do you understand?

18 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, your Honor.

19 THE COURT: I want to make sure that you understand  
20 that if you are not a United States citizen, your guilty plea  
21 and conviction make it very likely that you will be deported  
22 from the United States. Do you understand?

23 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, your Honor.

24 THE COURT: Have you discussed that with your  
25 attorney?

H9FKARNP

1 THE DEFENDANT: Well --

2 MR. BROUNSTEIN: He's a citizen, your Honor.

3 THE DEFENDANT: I'm a citizen.

4 THE COURT: Okay.

5 MR. BROUNSTEIN: He was born here.

6 THE COURT: Does the government have any reason to  
7 doubt that?

8 MR. SWETT: No, your Honor.

9 THE COURT: You have a statutory right to appeal.  
10 There are time constraints on your ability to file an appeal,  
11 and you need to talk to your lawyer about that following  
12 sentence. If you could not afford to hire a lawyer to help you  
13 prosecute the appeal, the Court would give you a lawyer for  
14 free.

15 Do you understand?

16 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I do.

17 THE COURT: Although you have a statutory right to  
18 appeal, under your agreement, you have agreed not to file a  
19 direct appeal, nor bring a collateral challenge, nor seek a  
20 sentence modification of any sentence within or below the  
21 guideline range of 12 to 18 months' imprisonment.

22 Do you understand?

23 THE DEFENDANT: Yeah, that's correct.

24 THE COURT: Do you have any questions for me before we  
25 continue?

H9FKARNP

1 THE DEFENDANT: No, your Honor.

2 THE COURT: Do you have any questions you'd like to  
3 ask your attorney in private before we continue?

4 THE DEFENDANT: No, sir.

5 THE COURT: Are you satisfied with your legal  
6 representation up to this point?

7 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, sir.

8 THE COURT: Defense counsel, are you aware of any  
9 reason why your client should not plead guilty?

10 MR. BROUNSTEIN: No, sir.

11 THE COURT: Are you aware of any legal defense to the  
12 charge?

13 MR. BROUNSTEIN: No, your Honor.

14 THE COURT: Mr. Arnstein, are you willing to give up  
15 your rights to a trial, the other rights that we have  
16 discussed?

17 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, your Honor.

18 THE COURT: Other than what's contained in Court  
19 Exhibit 1, your agreement with the government, has anyone made  
20 any promises to induce you to give up those rights?

21 THE DEFENDANT: No, sir.

22 THE COURT: Has anyone made any threats to force you  
23 to give up those rights?

24 THE DEFENDANT: No, sir.

25 THE COURT: How do you plead to Count One of the

H9FKARNP

1 information, guilty or not guilty?

2 THE DEFENDANT: I plead guilty.

3 THE COURT: What did you do that makes you guilty?

4 THE DEFENDANT: Between the approximate dates of  
5 February 2014 to February 2017, I, with the assistance of  
6 others, agreed to forge a judge's signature on a court order  
7 that was purported to emanate from the Southern District of New  
8 York. Prior to doing that, I had obtained a legal court order  
9 from the court seeking injunctive relief against an individual  
10 who conducted a defamatory campaign against myself and my  
11 business. After receiving that court order, I forged the  
12 judge's signature on subsequent orders that I created seeking  
13 similar relief. I knew that what I was doing was wrong, and I  
14 accept responsibility for my actions.

15 THE COURT: What did you do with those orders, once  
16 you created those counterfeit orders?

17 THE DEFENDANT: I submitted them to Google's legal  
18 department to request that they remove defamatory links about  
19 me and my company off of the Internet.

20 THE COURT: When you submitted those orders to Google,  
21 did you, in fact, know that those orders were counterfeit and  
22 that the judge's signature on those orders was forged?

23 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, your Honor.

24 THE COURT: Did you do that pursuant to an agreement  
25 that you had with other people to do that?

H9FKARNP

1 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, your Honor.

2 THE COURT: Was it your intention that Google believe  
3 this document, this order? Did you want Google to believe that  
4 this order was, in fact, authentic?

5 THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

6 THE COURT: Was that part of the agreement that you  
7 had with others as well?

8 THE DEFENDANT: Yes, it is.

9 THE COURT: Which boroughs were you in when you were  
10 doing this?

11 THE DEFENDANT: Manhattan.

12 THE COURT: Counsel for the government, is there any  
13 further allocution requested?

14 MR. SWETT: No, your Honor.

15 THE COURT: Counsel for the defense?

16 MR. BROUNSTEIN: No, Judge.

17 THE COURT: I find that Mr. Arnstein understands the  
18 rights that he's waiving by pleading guilty. I further find  
19 that there is a factual basis for the plea, and I will accept  
20 his plea of guilty. We will schedule a sentencing for Tuesday,  
21 January 16th, at 10:00 a.m.

22 Is there anything else from the government or the  
23 defense?

24 MR. SWETT: No, Judge.

25 MR. BROUNSTEIN: Judge, I do have an application,

H9FKARNP

1 Judge. When Mr. Arnstein was originally presented before the  
2 Magistrate's Court, he was released on his own recognizance,  
3 but there were certain travel restrictions placed on him.  
4 Those travel restrictions, he actually -- his residence now is  
5 in Hawaii. He was originally -- they went to arrest him in  
6 Hawaii, but his business was in New York, and he surrendered to  
7 authorities when he found out that he was being arrested.

8 He was released on his own recognizance with travel  
9 restrictions. I have made, Judge -- also, what the government  
10 has allowed him to do is there are certain travel within the  
11 United States, which the magistrate judge allowed, that with  
12 the government's consent, he can travel to those places.  
13 However, he does sometimes require to travel internationally.  
14 We did make two applications before the magistrates to travel  
15 internationally prior, and those applications were denied.  
16 Judge, I am making a specific application now to this Court.

17 Those two prior applications, Judge, had to do with  
18 his business, and I can certainly document that to you at a  
19 later date. Mr. Arnstein is a member of the United States --  
20 really Spartathlon ultramarathon team. He is an ultramarathon  
21 runner who runs hundred-mile distances. I did receive a letter  
22 that was actually addressed to the Court from the captain of  
23 that team, who is an attorney understanding Mr. Arnstein's  
24 restrictions, asking permission to allow him to represent the  
25 United States at an ultramarathon run in Greece during the last

H9FKARNP

1 week of September into the first week of October. If the Court  
2 would allow him to travel, what I would do is this: I would  
3 provide all the travel information to both the government and  
4 to pretrial services. Upon returning to the United States, I  
5 would have him surrender his passport within 48 hours again to  
6 pretrial services. And, Judge, I will detail and document all  
7 of his activities and places he's staying during that. It is a  
8 request. I do have it addressed to the Court. I'm asking the  
9 Court to allow him to do that, so he can represent the United  
10 States in this event.

11 THE COURT: And what exactly is his -- putting aside  
12 the ultramarathon running, what is his business that's in  
13 Hawaii?

14 MR. BROUNSTEIN: No, no. He lives in Hawaii. His  
15 residence is in Hawaii. His business requires international  
16 travel, but he hasn't. He's in -- which is really part and  
17 parcel of this matter, is he sort of manufactures and sells  
18 sapphire jewelry throughout the world, and he has a business  
19 interest, it's 12 employees who are in Sri Lanka and 12  
20 employees in New York, and his family lives in Hawaii, which he  
21 travels back and forth occasionally. There hasn't been any  
22 problems with that, Judge. He's lived up to all his  
23 requirements. He's reported to pretrial services when  
24 necessary. I speak to him probably at least two to three times  
25 a week, either by speaking to him or via email. I would ask

H9FKARNP

1 the Court allow him to go and represent his country in this  
2 matter.

3 I do have -- like I said, Judge, I do have a letter  
4 addressed to the Court from the captain of that team which  
5 explains the travel and what this event is. He has represented  
6 the United States in this event before.

7 THE COURT: What is it -- if he were allowed to do  
8 this, who does this actually benefit?

9 MR. BROUNSTEIN: Well, Judge, it's a team effort  
10 representing the United States of America. There's no money  
11 involved, there's nothing. It's just a question of national  
12 pride that he involves himself. He's been on this team for a  
13 number of years. He's a very well-recognized ultramarathon  
14 runner, and he wants to join his team representing his country.  
15 He's done this in the past. He is with others, he's not by  
16 himself. There is a team captain, and he is requesting  
17 permission to do that, to represent his country.

18 THE COURT: What exactly would there be preventing him  
19 from, if he were allowed to do this, from not only running in  
20 the ultramarathon, but running from this proceeding and not  
21 coming back to the United States?

22 MR. BROUNSTEIN: Judge, as I've stressed, that there  
23 are -- the guidelines in this case are not the type of  
24 guidelines where I think an individual would basically risk his  
25 business. He has 24 employees, he has a home in Yonkers. I



H9FKARNP

1 just think it's highly, highly unlikely that an individual --  
2 and certainly, Judge, there are extenuating circumstances to  
3 this case. The reason why he was arraigned earlier on and  
4 presented is that I could present an extensive application to  
5 the government to defer prosecution in this matter because I  
6 think there really are extenuating circumstances, and I will  
7 lay that out to the Court at the time of sentence, but this is  
8 a unique situation. So I don't believe he is going to run for  
9 anything. He voluntarily surrendered when he was arrested. He  
10 understands the nature and circumstances of his plea, he  
11 understands what he is facing. I just don't see him as an  
12 individual who is not going to return to court. He understands  
13 what his obligations are. He's been released on his own  
14 recognizance. There have been no situations where he's been  
15 late or even missed appointments in my office. He's been a  
16 responsible individual. And I think when the Court --  
17 ultimately, when the Court understands the nature of the facts  
18 and circumstances of this case, I think the Court will have a  
19 very, if not sympathetic, understanding of what happened here  
20 in this matter.

21 THE COURT: Okay. Again, it seems to me that from  
22 what you've described, there's nothing particularly about his  
23 business that would require him to be here. In the modern age  
24 of technology, he could certainly communicate with his staff  
25 remotely if he were in another country. The other thing is

H9FKARNP

1 there's nothing particularly -- while I'm sure he cares  
2 tremendously about running an ultramarathon, there's nothing  
3 particularly compelling about that for me to allow him to  
4 travel outside of the country to do that when he has been, it  
5 seems to me, sort of generously allowed to simply not really  
6 have a lot of restrictive conditions in terms of his monitoring  
7 at this point. He has now -- to the extent that there are any  
8 changed circumstances, he has now been convicted of this crime,  
9 and has now pled guilty and has even more incentive to  
10 potentially flee.

11 The nature of the offense -- and I am sure I will get  
12 more about that as we get closer to sentencing -- but the  
13 nature of the offense is one that doesn't particularly show a  
14 whole lot of reverence for the judicial process, so I am very  
15 concerned that he is a risk of flight. I'm not so concerned  
16 he's a risk of flight that I think he needs to be remanded, but  
17 I'm inclined to deny this application.

18 But I'll hear from the government, if there's anything  
19 they want to say.

20 MR. SWETT: The government agrees -- or the  
21 government's position would be that it's not appropriate to  
22 allow him to travel internationally. The Court has set forth  
23 many of the arguments the government would make.

24 I would also just note a couple of things: First of  
25 all, the first we heard of this application was this morning,

H9FKARNP

1 to my knowledge. The defendant has not yet even raised this  
2 with pretrial, and, obviously, their view would be relevant  
3 prior to granting such an application.

4 Secondly, given that we only learned about it, we have  
5 no idea the status of our extradition treaties with Greece.  
6 The two countries that Mr. Arnstein sought to travel to  
7 previously were China and England. One of those countries,  
8 obviously, would pose very serious problems for extradition,  
9 but the other one, the United Kingdom, is a country with which  
10 we have strong legal relationships, and even then, on a  
11 business-related trip, the Court found it was not compelling  
12 enough to grant what is an extraordinary allowance for someone  
13 who is on pretrial supervision, let alone someone who, as the  
14 Court noted, has now pled guilty to the crimes.

15 So, for those reasons and the reasons that the Court  
16 raised, we think that this application should not be granted.

17 MR. BROUNSTEIN: Your Honor, I understand the Court's  
18 position. I just want to answer one query the Court made about  
19 operating his business remotely. Mr. Arnstein is the face of  
20 that business. Most transactions which are conducted,  
21 important transactions, he does on a face-to-face basis, and  
22 one of the things that really has hurt his business was his  
23 inability to travel during this time period, particularly the  
24 trip to England where he was going to meet individuals from  
25 around the world who basically mine these stones that he buys.

H9FKARNP

1 So I say, Judge, if he were to flee, he wouldn't just be  
2 risking the loss of his freedom, he would lose his entire  
3 business.

4 These people -- this is really a third-generation  
5 business. He supports his family and his 24 employees, who he  
6 is extremely dedicated to and they are dedicated to him if he  
7 fled. So I understand the Court's position, but this is  
8 somewhat of a unique circumstance, and, as I said, he has met  
9 all his obligations, and I have no doubt that he will return to  
10 court at any time the Court requested him.

11 THE COURT: Okay. Again, as you've set forth, this is  
12 not travel for business, this is not travel to see some sick  
13 family, this is travel so he can run in a race.

14 MR. BROUNSTEIN: It is, Judge.

15 THE COURT: So that's denied. The application is  
16 denied.

17 MR. BROUNSTEIN: I understand, your Honor.

18 THE COURT: Anything else from the government?

19 MR. SWETT: No. Thank you, your Honor.

20 THE COURT: Anything else from the defense?

21 MR. BROUNSTEIN: No, sir.

22 THE COURT: Okay. We are adjourned.

23 \* \* \*